

# REGIONAL TRANSIT ISSUE PAPER

Agenda Item No.	Board Meeting Date	Open/Closed Session	Information/Action Item	Issue Date
9	09/11/17	Open	Information	09/06/17

Subject: Revising Peer Agency Group for Best Practices Comparison Purposes

## ISSUE

Revising Peer Agency Group for Best Practices Comparison Purposes

## RECOMMENDED ACTION

Information only.

## FISCAL IMPACT

None.

## DISCUSSION

Approximately 13 years ago, SacRT selected a set of peer transit agencies against whom SacRT would conduct comparisons for its financial documents. The peers consist of transit agencies found throughout the United States that have comparable bus or rail systems. Although not a Federal or State requirement, on-going peer analysis is a valuable tool used to identify organizational strengths and weaknesses and measure improved performance against external benchmarks.

Those peers included:

<u>Agency Name</u>	<u>Modes</u>
Central Ohio Transit Authority	Bus
Charlotte Area Transit System*	Bus
Long Beach Transit	Bus
Niagara Frontier Transportation Authority*	Bus
Pierce County Transportation Benefit Area Auth.	Bus
San Mateo County Transit District	Bus
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Auth.	Bus / Light Rail
Dallas Area Rapid Transit*	Light Rail
Denver Regional Transportation District*	Light Rail
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System*	Light Rail
Tri-County Metropolitan Transportation Dist.*	Light Rail
Utah Transit Authority*	Light Rail

\* Only one mode of multi-modal agency used for comparison.

Approved:

Presented:

Final 09/06/17

General Manager/CEO

Director, Office of Management & Budget

J:\Board Meeting Documents\2017\13 September 11, 2017\Peer Transit Agencies.doc

Agenda Item No.	Board Meeting Date	Open/Closed Session	Information/Action Item	Issue Date
9	09/11/17	Open	Information	09/06/17

Subject: Revising Peer Agency Group for Best Practices Comparison Purposes

Recently while examining the data, we determined that the criteria used in the past did not consider the important fact that the non-California agencies may be located in lower cost of living areas and are often subject to different regulations. Therefore, using non-California agencies for cost comparison purposes is not reasonable. Some of these regulations differences include: SacRT being subject to no tort liability cap while other states may have limits as low as \$500,000 per occurrence, more aggressive and earlier enacted pension reform, and environmental compliance costs.

Based on these reasons, it would be more accurate to use peer transit agencies found within California. Therefore, for future financial documents, such as the budget and comprehensive annual financial report, we will be using the following agencies below for comparison purposes. This would not affect peers that may be selected by outside agencies that do audits or reviews of SacRT as they may have to follow different criteria and guidelines.

<u>Agency Name</u>	<u>Modes</u>
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	Bus / Light Rail
San Francisco Municipal Railway	Bus / Light Rail
Los Angeles County Metro Transp. Authority	Bus / Light Rail
San Diego Metro. Transit System	Bus / Light Rail
San Mateo County Transit District	Bus
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	Bus

Attachment 1 shows the comparison of important performance indicators and statistics with these peers based on data available in the National Transportation Database.

# ATTACHMENT 1

Light Rail Peer Group	Vehicle Operations Hours	Salaries & Wages	Hourly Rate <sup>1</sup>	Hourly to SacRT
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	281,226	10,877,887	<b>\$38.68</b>	<b>120%</b>
San Francisco Municipal Railway	956,005	33,777,176	<b>\$35.33</b>	<b>109%</b>
Sacramento Regional Transit District	202,529	6,548,569	<b>\$32.33</b>	<b>100%</b>
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba: Metro	1,218,176	35,891,235	<b>\$29.46</b>	<b>91%</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	582,274	13,180,417	<b>\$22.64</b>	<b>70%</b>

Bus Peer Group	Vehicle Operations Hours	Salaries & Wages	Hourly Rate <sup>1</sup>	Hourly to SacRT
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	1,822,672	65,998,523	<b>\$36.21</b>	<b>134%</b>
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	1,587,939	57,368,468	<b>\$36.13</b>	<b>133%</b>
San Francisco Municipal Railway	2,572,192	82,168,461	<b>\$31.94</b>	<b>118%</b>
San Mateo County Transit District	662,161	21,150,010	<b>\$31.94</b>	<b>118%</b>
Sacramento Regional Transit District	777,313	21,056,510	<b>\$27.09</b>	<b>100%</b>
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba: Metro	8,813,150	235,689,021	<b>\$26.74</b>	<b>99%</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	1,058,661	25,123,728	<b>\$23.73</b>	<b>88%</b>

Notes:

<sup>1</sup> Blended Rate for Vehicle Operations includes straight time and overtime rate for Operators, Dispatchers, Superintendents.

Source: 2015 NTD report, Vehicle Operations wages/ working hours

## Cost per Passenger

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Mateo County Transit District	\$7.47	\$8.23	\$8.47	\$7.64	\$8.41		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$6.51	\$6.77	\$6.93	\$7.29	\$7.32		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$4.94</b>	<b>\$5.23</b>	<b>\$5.35</b>	<b>\$5.71</b>	<b>\$5.64</b>	<b>\$6.55</b>	<b>\$7.12</b>
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	\$4.97	\$5.49	\$5.32	\$5.21	\$5.55		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$2.98	\$3.06	\$3.38	\$3.18	\$3.35		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$2.78	\$2.58	\$2.65	\$2.87	\$3.06		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	\$2.67	\$2.56	\$2.66	\$2.66	\$2.91		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$5.87	\$5.95	\$6.42	\$6.82	\$7.17		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$3.49</b>	<b>\$3.45</b>	<b>\$3.70</b>	<b>\$4.31</b>	<b>\$4.72</b>	<b>\$4.82</b>	<b>\$5.22</b>
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	\$3.55	\$3.75	\$3.69	\$4.05	\$4.23		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$3.31	\$3.79	\$4.02	\$3.91	\$3.75		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$1.91	\$1.94	\$2.23	\$1.80	\$1.82		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Cost per Revenue Vehicle Hour

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Mateo County Transit District	\$187.43	\$192.99	\$260.67	\$230.30	\$258.55		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$176.46	\$169.76	\$176.52	\$192.96	\$195.14		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	\$169.01	\$182.30	\$182.13	\$179.53	\$183.93		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$174.99	\$182.48	\$185.53	\$189.88	\$183.27		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba:	\$139.17	\$138.42	\$143.36	\$141.01	\$145.67		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$134.24</b>	<b>\$136.00</b>	<b>\$138.69</b>	<b>\$142.09</b>	<b>\$140.40</b>	<b>\$142.98</b>	<b>\$148.82</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$107.76	\$116.62	\$124.13	\$114.00	\$113.41		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba:	\$381.64	\$388.27	\$359.02	\$376.45	\$390.69		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$321.93	\$316.83	\$347.59	\$341.47	\$366.66		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$267.16	\$304.05	\$330.28	\$436.67	\$359.49		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$229.30</b>	<b>\$232.56</b>	<b>\$230.28</b>	<b>\$251.29</b>	<b>\$260.88</b>	<b>\$240.34</b>	<b>\$230.60</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$142.85	\$148.06	\$140.67	\$142.02	\$147.48		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Cost per Revenue Vehicle Mile

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$21.17	\$20.43	\$21.42	\$23.81	\$24.65		
San Mateo County Transit District	\$19.00	\$19.55	\$19.44	\$17.94	\$21.70		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	\$14.84	\$16.13	\$16.21	\$16.67	\$17.30		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$14.22	\$15.09	\$15.39	\$15.97	\$15.65		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba: Metro	\$12.20	\$12.51	\$13.14	\$13.13	\$13.70		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$12.04</b>	<b>\$12.25</b>	<b>\$12.52</b>	<b>\$12.98</b>	<b>\$12.82</b>	<b>\$12.98</b>	<b>\$13.42</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$9.93	\$10.73	\$11.41	\$10.42	\$9.56		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$28.92	\$31.70	\$34.63	\$40.47	\$37.89		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$19.92	\$20.00	\$21.50	\$22.03	\$23.11		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba: Metro	\$17.20	\$18.07	\$17.74	\$18.61	\$19.39		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$11.85</b>	<b>\$11.91</b>	<b>\$12.76</b>	<b>\$13.92</b>	<b>\$14.46</b>	<b>\$13.49</b>	<b>\$14.02</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$8.03	\$8.39	\$8.55	\$8.41	\$8.50		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Fare Box Recovery Ratio

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	32.1%	31.2%	29.3%	30.6%	29.7%		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	28.7%	30.4%	33.5%	29.0%	28.4%		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority	29.0%	30.5%	27.5%	27.4%	27.2%		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	17.8%	19.4%	19.9%	20.4%	20.3%		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>22.4%</b>	<b>21.0%</b>	<b>20.4%</b>	<b>19.4%</b>	<b>19.6%</b>	<b>18.5%</b>	<b>18.2%</b>
San Mateo County Transit District	15.2%	15.1%	15.8%	17.7%	15.8%		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	14.1%	13.2%	12.8%	12.1%	12.2%		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	57.4%	55.6%	53.6%	56.1%	56.3%		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>31.7%</b>	<b>31.9%</b>	<b>29.4%</b>	<b>25.6%</b>	<b>23.4%</b>	<b>22.7%</b>	<b>24.9%</b>
San Francisco Municipal Railway	24.2%	23.2%	22.1%	20.7%	23.2%		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority	21.0%	18.8%	19.0%	17.2%	18.0%		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	15.7%	15.0%	13.8%	13.0%	12.4%		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Unlinked Passenger Trips (Ridership)

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	343,880,718	338,606,083	336,447,033	336,042,385	318,380,729		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	89,450,656	95,625,357	97,180,861	98,365,557	95,005,347		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	57,333,196	53,642,880	54,929,401	53,194,052	52,593,819		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	31,395,136	32,053,755	32,404,598	32,475,527	32,623,832		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	27,252,222	28,801,745	28,926,914	28,541,485	27,263,712		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>13,617,462</b>	<b>13,145,864</b>	<b>13,784,179</b>	<b>13,657,668</b>	<b>13,697,260</b>	<b>12,104,565</b>	<b>11,600,000</b>
San Mateo County Transit District	10,491,731	9,960,197	9,584,955	9,967,036	10,368,158		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	49,252,315	53,780,784	63,652,197	63,704,768	62,775,109		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	51,021,623	43,607,739	45,358,815	48,779,247	49,076,058		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	31,612,877	32,654,613	29,699,366	39,694,632	40,082,461		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>12,543,866</b>	<b>13,192,601</b>	<b>13,513,471</b>	<b>12,710,476</b>	<b>12,061,741</b>	<b>12,216,162</b>	<b>12,400,000</b>
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	10,014,514	10,372,862	10,742,292	10,952,965	11,341,207		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data



## Passengers per RVH

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	63.4	65.8	66.5	67.2	63.7		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	52.1	54.1	54.0	53.0	50.0		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	36.2	38.1	36.8	35.9	33.8		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	34.0	33.2	34.2	34.5	33.1		
San Mateo County Transit District	25.1	23.5	30.8	30.2	30.8		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	26.9	27.0	26.8	26.1	25.1		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>27.2</b>	<b>26.0</b>	<b>25.9</b>	<b>24.9</b>	<b>24.9</b>	<b>21.8</b>	<b>20.9</b>
<b>Light Rail</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	80.7	80.2	82.1	111.7	95.9		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	107.6	103.7	97.3	93.0	92.3		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	74.8	76.4	63.0	78.7	80.9		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>65.6</b>	<b>67.4</b>	<b>62.2</b>	<b>58.3</b>	<b>55.3</b>	<b>49.8</b>	<b>44.2</b>
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	54.8	53.3	54.1	50.1	51.1		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Passengers per RVM

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	7.6	7.9	8.1	8.3	8.0		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba:	4.6	4.9	4.9	4.9	4.7		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	3.0	2.9	3.0	3.2	3.1		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	3.3	3.5	3.4	3.3	2.9		
San Mateo County Transit District	2.5	2.4	2.3	2.3	2.6		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>2.4</b>	<b>2.3</b>	<b>2.3</b>	<b>2.3</b>	<b>2.3</b>	<b>2.0</b>	<b>1.9</b>
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	2.2	2.2	2.2	2.2	2.1		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	8.7	8.4	8.6	10.4	10.1		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	4.2	4.3	3.8	4.7	4.7		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba:	4.9	4.8	4.8	4.6	4.6		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	3.4	3.4	3.3	3.2	3.2		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>3.4</b>	<b>3.5</b>	<b>3.4</b>	<b>3.2</b>	<b>3.1</b>	<b>2.8</b>	<b>2.7</b>

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Average Fare

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Mateo County Transit District	\$1.13	\$1.24	\$1.34	\$1.35	\$1.33		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	\$0.88	\$1.06	\$1.06	\$1.06	\$1.13		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$1.11</b>	<b>\$1.10</b>	<b>\$1.09</b>	<b>\$1.11</b>	<b>\$1.10</b>	<b>\$1.21</b>	<b>\$1.30</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$0.96	\$0.95	\$0.99	\$0.97	\$1.00		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$0.92	\$0.89	\$0.89	\$0.88	\$0.89		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$0.80	\$0.78	\$0.89	\$0.83	\$0.87		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	\$0.77	\$0.78	\$0.73	\$0.73	\$0.79		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$1.11</b>	<b>\$1.10</b>	<b>\$1.09</b>	<b>\$1.11</b>	<b>\$1.10</b>	<b>\$1.10</b>	<b>\$1.30</b>
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$1.10	\$1.08	\$1.20	\$1.01	\$1.03		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$0.92	\$0.89	\$0.89	\$0.88	\$0.89		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$0.80	\$0.88	\$0.89	\$0.81	\$0.87		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba	\$0.74	\$0.70	\$0.70	\$0.70	\$0.76		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Subsidy per Passenger

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Mateo County Transit District	\$6.34	\$6.99	\$7.12	\$6.29	\$7.08		
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$5.59	\$5.88	\$6.04	\$6.40	\$6.42		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$3.83</b>	<b>\$4.13</b>	<b>\$4.26</b>	<b>\$4.60</b>	<b>\$4.53</b>	<b>\$5.34</b>	<b>\$5.82</b>
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	\$4.09	\$4.42	\$4.26	\$4.15	\$4.43		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$2.02	\$2.11	\$2.39	\$2.20	\$2.36		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$1.98	\$1.79	\$1.77	\$2.04	\$2.19		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba:	\$1.90	\$1.78	\$1.92	\$1.93	\$2.12		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$4.95	\$5.06	\$5.53	\$5.94	\$6.28		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$2.39</b>	<b>\$2.35</b>	<b>\$2.61</b>	<b>\$3.21</b>	<b>\$3.62</b>	<b>\$3.73</b>	<b>\$3.92</b>
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority dba:	\$2.80	\$3.04	\$2.99	\$3.35	\$3.47		
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$2.51	\$2.91	\$3.13	\$3.10	\$2.88		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$0.81	\$0.86	\$1.04	\$0.79	\$0.80		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data

## Fare Revenue earned per RVH

Transit Agencies by mode	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016*	2017**
<b>Bus</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$50.69	\$51.56	\$59.13	\$55.93	\$55.44		
San Mateo County Transit District	\$28.45	\$29.07	\$41.31	\$40.78	\$40.90		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority	\$40.37	\$42.24	\$39.46	\$38.62	\$39.67		
Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District	\$30.06	\$35.39	\$36.26	\$36.67	\$37.30		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$34.58	\$36.34	\$36.37	\$34.94	\$33.69		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$30.08</b>	<b>\$28.57</b>	<b>\$28.23</b>	<b>\$27.53</b>	<b>\$27.45</b>	<b>\$26.40</b>	<b>\$27.15</b>
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$24.72	\$24.00	\$23.80	\$23.03	\$22.31		
<b>Light Rail</b>							
San Francisco Municipal Railway	\$64.54	\$70.40	\$73.04	\$90.61	\$83.48		
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System	\$82.01	\$82.36	\$75.38	\$79.72	\$83.00		
Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority	\$80.01	\$72.83	\$68.12	\$64.81	\$70.44		
<b>Sacramento Regional Transit District</b>	<b>\$72.68</b>	<b>\$74.11</b>	<b>\$67.81</b>	<b>\$64.43</b>	<b>\$60.94</b>	<b>\$54.66</b>	<b>\$57.38</b>
Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority	\$50.44	\$47.40	\$48.06	\$44.24	\$45.33		

\* Available from other Agencies October 2017; SacRT figures are as reported to NTD.

\*\*2017 metrics are based on FY 2017 Budget and not NTD data